



Hybrid Language Learning: Lesson Learned from Vocational School Teachers and Students

Pembelajaran Bahasa secara *Hybrid*: Hal yang bisa Dipelajari dari Guru dan Murid Sekolah Menengah Kejuruan

Renindea Isnaini, Francisca Maria Ivone*, Mirjam Anugerahwati

Universitas Negeri Malang, Jl. Semarang No. 5 Malang, Jawa Timur, Indonesia

*Penulis korespondensi, Surel: francisca.maria.fs@um.ac.id

Paper received: 5-1-2022; revised: 2-3-2022; accepted: 9-3-2022

Abstract

The shift from remote learning to hybrid learning mode during the Covid-19 pandemic resulted in positive and not so favorable experiences to English teachers and students. Their experiences are worthy of investigation, from the preparations needed in hybrid language learning using Moodle, the problems that arise during learning, to how these problems can be overcome. The reported study used a case study with a descriptive qualitative approach to investigate these issues. In-depth interviews were conducted to collect data from the selected teachers and students. The subjects were three English teachers and five eleventh graders purposefully selected based on some selection criteria. Results of the interviews showed that the teachers and students had different experiences in hybrid language learning using *Moodle-based LMS* in terms of the preparation needed, challenges found and solutions of the challenges. Creating interactive materials was challenging for teachers, while internet connection and study independently were the most challenging aspects for students. Awareness of these problems and creativity in designing and using simple and easy to understand materials should be taken into teachers' consideration. Furthermore, they need to identify and anticipate common student-related issues so that they can address them well. Moreover, teachers and students should work together to find the solutions to hybrid learning obstacles that work best for them.

Keywords: Moodle-based LMS; hybrid learning; language learning

Abstrak

Pergeseran dari pembelajaran jarak jauh ke mode pembelajaran hybrid selama pandemi Covid-19 menghasilkan pengalaman yang positif dan tidak begitu menguntungkan bagi guru dan siswa bahasa Inggris. Pengalaman mereka layak untuk ditelaah, mulai dari persiapan yang dibutuhkan dalam pembelajaran bahasa hybrid menggunakan Moodle, permasalahan yang muncul selama pembelajaran, hingga bagaimana permasalahan tersebut dapat diatasi. Studi yang dilaporkan menggunakan studi kasus dengan pendekatan kualitatif deskriptif untuk menyelidiki masalah ini. Wawancara mendalam dilakukan untuk mengumpulkan data dari guru dan siswa terpilih. Subjeknya adalah tiga guru bahasa Inggris dan lima siswa kelas sebelas yang dipilih secara sengaja berdasarkan beberapa kriteria seleksi. Hasil wawancara menunjukkan bahwa guru dan siswa memiliki pengalaman yang berbeda dalam pembelajaran bahasa hibrida menggunakan LMS berbasis Moodle dalam hal persiapan yang dibutuhkan, tantangan yang ditemukan dan solusi dari tantangan tersebut. Membuat materi interaktif merupakan tantangan tersendiri bagi guru, sedangkan koneksi internet dan belajar mandiri merupakan aspek yang paling menantang bagi siswa. Kesadaran akan masalah ini dan kreativitas dalam merancang dan menggunakan materi yang sederhana dan mudah dipahami harus menjadi pertimbangan guru. Selanjutnya, mereka perlu mengidentifikasi dan mengantisipasi masalah umum terkait siswa sehingga mereka dapat mengatasinya dengan baik. Selain itu, guru dan siswa harus bekerja sama untuk menemukan solusi untuk hambatan pembelajaran hibrida yang paling cocok untuk mereka.

Kata kunci: Moodle-based LMS; hybrid learning; pembelajaran bahasa

1. Introduction

The outbreak of the COVID-19 pandemic has brought new challenges in many aspects of human life, especially education. It has triggered the change from face-to-face to remote learning so that formal teaching and learning activities can proceed as usual despite the pandemic (Gillis & Krull, 2020). At first, due to this condition, Emergency Remote Learning was implemented. Hodges, Moore, Lockee, Trust, and Bond (2020) define emergency remote learning as a temporary teaching and learning activity that substitute face-to-face learning due to emergency conditions, such as virus outbreaks. As the spread of COVID-19 outbreaks decreases, the remote learning program changes into hybrid learning. Hybrid learning integrates face-to-face and online instruction into one, continuous learning experience. Students attend around half of the class sessions on location, while the other half work online (College of DuPage, 2015).

The shift from remote learning to hybrid learning resulted in various responses, both from teachers and students in language learning. The implementation of hybrid language learning is usually supported by the Learning Management System (LMS), for instance, *Moodle*. It is a learning management system that allows teachers to construct an online classroom environment that allows for significant interaction and collaboration with their students. *Moodle* has a set of design features that enable instructors and students to communicate, collaborate, and engage in online learning in a variety of engaging ways (Singh, 2010). *Moodle* can be used to enhance traditional classroom instruction, to conduct entirely online courses or even for hybrid learning approaches.

Over the past ten years, hybrid learning has been a significant development factor in the English language education field (Klimova & Kacetyl, 2015). To gain more information about hybrid language learning through a *Moodle-based LMS*, language teachers and students' experiences must be investigated. The term of experience is typically used to describe what actually happened to individuals (Latham, 2007). Experience is a subjective and holistic phenomenon (Wright, et al., 2003; Vyas & Veer, 2006). Experience refers to a situation in which a person thinks relatively, the result of guessing, based on feelings or tastes. It is an attitude based on personal views or feelings about something (Moradi, Abdi, Valiee, & Rezaei, 2020).

The use of *Moodle-based LMS* during the COVID-19 pandemic resulted in various experiences, both from teachers and students in language learning. Although must be hybridly implemented, the learning objectives must be achieved properly. Therefore, teachers' and students need to be well-prepared to succeed in teaching and learning activities. The teachers' need to prepare materials or content, students' needs and conditions, and implementation of distance learning (Kemdikbud, 2020). In accordance, UNESCO (2020) noted the preparedness readiness for these situations comprise technological, content, pedagogical and home-based learning support, and monitoring and evaluation readiness. However, students' need to prepare technological tools (electronic devices), internet connection, and materials (Prasetyaningtyas, 2021). Parents' support and comfortable learning circumstances also play important roles (Efriana, 2021).

For learning needs, *Moodle* is used for sharing materials, managing communication, and setting up activities. It helps teachers to develop practical language learning skills, such as listening comprehension, reading and writing, speaking and specific terminology independently. At the same time, teachers can control and check the students' assignments

without extra workload (Holiver, Kurbatova, & Bondar, 2020). Texts, HTML documents, and multimedia resources could all be used in *Moodle-based LMS*. Fill in the blanks, true or false, multiple choice, and other types of tasks are featured. Furthermore, students can review each other's work, with the ability of more corrective feedback, which encourages critical thinking. Students can listen to audio recordings, see videos, answer questions, expand their vocabulary, and take tests on themes including grammar, intercultural communication, and lexical issues (Smith et al., 2020).

Focusing on the barriers, teachers experienced lack of training in the use of *Moodle* that affected the teaching and learning activities (Bhalalusesa, Lukwaro, & Clemence, 2013). The lack of training in creating interactive and creative materials and contents from home also become a problem for teachers (Prasetya, 2021). However, students experienced unfamiliarity with the e-learning platform and the interactions among the students and teacher, the technology and internet connection, and physical conditions (Octaberlina & Muslimin, 2020). Similarly, students experienced three barriers during online learning including unfamiliarity of e-learning, slow internet connection, and physical condition e.g. eye strain (Churiyah, Sholikhan, Filanti, & Sakdiyyah, 2020).

To resolve the problem, teachers must join training provided by schools, government, or learning independently with partners over the internet (Bhalalusesa et al., 2013). To overcome the students' problems, Octaberlina and Muslimin (2020) proposed training to implement how to use the e-learning platform before the actual class is needed. Teachers need to consider the learning goals and students' learning styles, offering feedback, and maintaining more interactions. Convert the size of the documents (video material to audio) and use texts but not too many texts, and give a break during the online class needed. Similarly, Churiyah et al. (2020) suggested providing training to implement the LMS before the real class, converting high-definition or big-size files into smaller ones, and giving break during the online class.

Previous studies only investigate the teachers' experience of using *Moodle-based LMS* for language learning in higher education covering the preparation needs before the implementation for hybrid learning (Kemdikbud, 2020), the preparedness readiness (UNESCO, 2020), students' preparation needs' and parents support (Efriana, 2021), *Moodle-based LMS* features and usability (Holiver et al., 2020; Smith, et al., 2020). Furthermore, previous study investigates challenges that teachers and students experienced of the use of *Moodle-based LMS* for learning during the COVID-19 pandemic and effort to overcome the challenge (Bhalalusesa et al., 2013; Prasetya 2021; Octaberlina & Muslimin, 2020; Churiyah et al., 2020).

However, the study focuses on discovering teachers and students' experiences using *Moodle-based LMS* during hybrid learning in a vocational school setting during COVID-19 outbreak, a situation in which half of each class learns from home using a *Moodle-based LMS* and the other half learns in person at school. The vocational education level was chosen to explore how hybrid learning using *Moodle-based LMS* is implemented for language learning guided by following research questions: 1) What are the experience and preparation needed for using *Moodle-based LMS* by English teachers and eleventh graders for implementing hybrid language learning?; 2) What are the challenges the English teachers and eleventh graders at SMKN 1 Ponorogo experience in hybrid language teaching and learning using a *Moodle-based LMS*?; 3) What do the English teachers and eleventh graders at SMKN 1 Ponorogo do to

overcome the challenges they face during hybrid language teaching and learning English using a *Moodle-based LMS*?

2. Methods

Design and Approach

The study belongs to a case study conducted over time through detailed, in-depth data collection by interviewing selected participants (Creswell, Hanson, Plano, & Morales, 2007). The approach used in this study was descriptive qualitative which describe a phenomenon and the real-life context in which it occurred (Yin, 2003; Baxter & Jack, 2015). In this study, case study design with descriptive qualitative approach aims to describe the teachers and students experience of the use of *Moodle-based LMS* for hybrid language learning.

Subject and Setting

This study was conducted at SMKN 1 Ponorogo during the COVID-19 pandemic. The reasons to choose SMKN 1 Ponorogo is that the school has experienced face-to-face learning, emergency remote learning and hybrid learning. The school also used *Moodle-based LMS* for hybrid language learning.

Following the identification of the research topic and question, the researcher selects a person to interview based on a set of criteria. The criteria for an English teacher were English teachers, being an experienced English teacher, having been teaching English at SMKN 1 Ponorogo for the last three years, use *Moodle* hybrid English teaching, and experience challenge and know how to overcome the challenge of using *Moodle* for hybrid English learning and teaching. However, the criteria for students were majoring Office Automation and Governance at eleventh grade, had an English score above 75 in the last semester during the pandemic, and experience challenge and know how to overcome the challenge of using *Moodle* for hybrid English learning. The selected participants chosen were three English teachers and five eleventh graders based on the criteria.

English teachers were chosen since the study covered language learning. Eleventh graders chosen were majoring Office Automation and Governance at eleventh grade. The reason they chose this major is because the graduates can engage as a business secretary or administrative assistant, thus their English as a foreign language skill must be improved and fluent. The reason to choose eleventh graders was they experienced emergency remote learning when they were in the tenth grade and now experienced hybrid learning in their eleventh grade. They are clearly more experienced in the implementation of hybrid language learning using *Moodle-based LMS*, covering challenges and solutions to problems encountered.

Instruments

The data collection instrument used in this study was an interview guide. The in-depth interview was conducted in *Bahasa, Indonesia*. A semi-structured interview was a suitable instrument for a case study to gather in-depth data since there was an interview guideline to help define the areas to be explored. It allowed both the interviewer and interviewee to diverge from pursuing an idea or response in more detail (Gill, Stewart, Treasure, & Chadwick, 2008).

There will be eight questions for English teachers and ten questions for eleventh graders covering the research problem. The first is about experience and preparation needed for the

use of *Moodle-based LMS* for hybrid language learning which has following indicators for English teachers: a) preparation needed before using *Moodle-based LMS* in hybrid language learning, b) features on *Moodle* used for teaching and learning activities, c) assessment. Moreover, the following are indicators for students: features usually used and its function, b) online materials on *Moodle-based LMS*, and c) assignment submission.

The second research question is about challenges of the use of *Moodle* for hybrid language learning which have three indicators for English teachers: a) technical problems and difficulty on using *Moodle*, b) difficulty on creating interactive learning media and assessment, and c) difficulty on assessing the students. Furthermore, students have following indicators: a) the material is difficult to understand, b) the learning media is not engaging, c) lack of technological tools (laptop, computer, mobile phone, internet connection), d) social distraction from the environment (the house is near the road or public places), e) family distraction (doing chores or help), f) other distraction (games, social media)

The third research question is about how English teachers and students overcome the challenges. English teachers have three indicators, a) preparing teaching and learning needs better and creatively and b) joining seminars or evaluation programs. However, students can: a) backup internet connection, b) printing or noting materials from the internet, c) ask for help, and d) avoid distraction.

Data Collection Procedures

After selecting the participants, the researcher set a schedule of interviews with all participants selected. The researcher interviewed the participants one by one. The process of the interview will be recorded. The data analysis will answer the research questions.

Data analysis

In this study, the researcher followed three steps of data analysis procedures proposed by Miles and Huberman (1994): 1) data reduction to select, simplifying and transforming the data in written form, 2) data display to organized and compressed information or data collected clearly in the form of narrative text to answer the research questions, and 3) conclusion drawing used to correlate the theory with the data collected to find a credible conclusion.

Following the research questions, the discussion will be given in the following order: 1) preparation needed of the use of *Moodle-based LMS* for hybrid English learning; 2) challenges of the use of *Moodle-based LMS* for hybrid English learning; and 3) steps to overcome the challenges of the use of *Moodle-based LMS* for hybrid language learning.

Findings and Discussions

In this part, the researcher presents the research findings and discussions based on the analysis of in-depth interviews, which was supposed to be to English teachers and eleven graders' experience of the use of *Moodle* in hybrid language learning at SMK N 1 Ponorogo.

3. Findings and Discussion

3.1. Experience and preparation needed of the use of Moodle-based LMS for Hybrid Language Learning

The English teachers and eleventh graders encountered three main issues: 1) preparation needed for hybrid language learning using Moodle, 2) Moodle-based LMS features used, and 3) assessments.

Preparation Needed

Before conducting a teaching and learning activity using Moodle-based LMS in implementing hybrid language learning, as summarize to the following table:

Table 1. Teachers and Students Preparation Needed

Preparation needed	English Teachers	Moodle-based LMS, Computer, laptop, smartphone, internet connection – WiFi or data, material from course book and additional from other sources and lesson plan, including KD and English Curriculum.
	Eleventh Graders	Course book, notebooks and assignment books, Stationery, worksheets, devices as tools to access Moodle, snacks and drinks.

In this indicator, the English teachers mentioned that they need to prepare the Moodle, lesson plan, English book (material) and worksheets, notes (note for the students and other grade and their presence), internet connection, and computer (ET 1).

The interview results follow what was conveyed in research conducted by Octaberlina and Muslimin (2020), which stated that the readiness of LMS and internet connections are essential points that must be prepared to facilitate online learning from home. Abuhammad (2020) also stated the same thing and emphasized that the speed of the internet and LMS fluency in the learning process also affected online teaching and learning activities.

Teachers also have to make sure the materials and worksheets match KD and the English curriculum. For this reason, there is a need for in-depth study and compatibility between the required essential competencies and the material taught. The material for the English teacher at SMKN 1 Ponorogo comes from handouts and textbooks. SMKN 1 Ponorogo uses a book from Erlangga Publisher, entitled Forward an English course for Vocational School Students Grade XI, by Lande and Astuti. An interactive book from Intan Pariwara also supports it specifically for business and management expertise (ET 2). For addition, English teachers also put additional materials from Youtube (ET 3). Using printed books or course books as the primary source of learning and providing exploration opportunities for students to find as many other sources as possible, such as research conducted by Octaberlina and Muslimin (2020).

Meanwhile, based on student experience, the study showed that students also prepare the learning material to help them learn actively and comfortably. They prepare notebooks and assignment books, stationery, course books, worksheets, and devices as tools to access Moodle (ST 4). Some prepare snacks and drinks (ST 2). A student stated,

“I have to make sure that the mobile phone is full before the class starts. It helps me stay focused and study.” (ST 5)

One primary tool they must have is a device. The device could be a smartphone or a laptop computer. This device is tied to an internet connection, both from *WiFi* and data. Students feel that learning to use mobile phones is easier because it is flexible (ST 1), effective and efficient to do many tasks and saves quota (ST 3). Churiyah et al. (2020) also shows that mobile phones are used more than laptops or computers when learning online because they are considered more effective.

Moodle-based LMS features

English teachers and eleventh graders have mentioned features usually used and procedures on the use of *Moodle-based LMS* for hybrid language learning as summarized in the table follows:

Table 2 Moodle-based LMS Features Used by Teachers and Students

Features	English Teachers	Discussion forum, assignments and submission, links to other sources material; quiz, messaging, announcement and online calendar.
	Eleventh Graders	Attendance list, announcement, forum discussions, assignments, and submissions.

Moodle-based LMS enables the creation of a course website depending on the institutions. (Ivanović et al., 2013) The features provided by Moodle-based LMS in SMKN 1 Ponorogo provide the discussions forums among teachers and students, assignment and the submission, video links or Google Drive links for the students or anyone inside the class, online quizzes, messaging, announcement, and online calendar. Teachers or students from any device can access these features quickly. The features provided in *Moodle* SMKN 1 Ponorogo are set based on the needs of students and teachers in teaching and learning activities.

One teacher said,

"We can access all Moodle LMS features, but we usually use the discussion forums, assignments, and task submissions. The one that I like the most is the online quizzes in multiple choices, and once students finish the quiz, the result is shown directly."(ET 1)

Another teacher mentioned,

"All features in our school's Moodle are used effectively based on its function, such as we have a discussion forum for discussing the materials or tasks, the submission section to submit the task, the instant messages for directly reaching the teacher, and the quizzes." (ET 3)

Students always checked the announcement, forum discussions, assignments, and submissions the most based on the study. According to students, accessing *Moodle-based LMS* during hybrid learning fills in the attendance (ST 3), checking the announcements, and viewing subject discussion forums to get material (ST 4). They also read and study the material independently, conduct discussions, do assignments, access additional material from YouTube in the discussion forum (ST 5) and submit assignments (ST 2).

The features proposed by *Moodle-based LMS* at SMKN 1 Ponorogo are the same features Altholli (2015) proposed for his study. He also stated that the features are usually created based on the course need, but the main features are forum discussions, assignments and submissions, instant messages, and quizzes (Altholli, 2015). The features of *Moodle* used in SMKN 1 Ponorogo are prioritized, which are indeed used to support learning activities. English

teachers find these features helpful. Simple layouts help teachers and students easily understand (ST 1) and access material easily accessible for students (ST 4). Training before the implementation of learning using *Moodle* also helps a lot (ET 2). English teachers also like discussion forums the most since they can easily check and discuss materials or assignments (ET 1).

A study by Suppasetsee and Dennis (2010) showed that the layout usability of *Moodle* is influential in increasing the success of online learning activities. They found the fact that *Moodle's* layout and design were simple but suited to their needs better. Their study proved that over 91% of respondents found the *Moodle* user information was easy to understand, with nearly 90% agreeing that the *Moodle* layout was well structured and easy to navigate.

Assessments

For the *assessments*, English teachers and eleventh graders has different experience, as summarized as follows:

Table 3 Assessment Experienced by Teachers and Students

Assessments	English Teachers	Provide quiz and final assessment through <i>Moodle</i> and uses <i>Google Forms</i> or <i>Quizzes</i> for daily assignments and understanding the material.
	Eleventh Graders	Do assignments on a workbook and directly upload the results of their assignments to <i>Moodle</i> by taking pictures of their work or typing in the form of <i>Words</i> .

The study found that the English teacher prepares quizzes or assessments through the *Moodle* application, usually for the final assessment, and uses other websites such as *Google Forms* or *Quizzes* for daily assignments and understanding the material.

As stated as an English teacher as follow:

"I like to ask students to think. Before class, I usually provide a Google Form link that contains questions related to the material to be discussed. Mainly, the answers to these questions will be a summary of the material that makes it easier for students to understand the material independently." (ET 3)

Giving student quizzes could help students better understand the materials (ET 2). The English teacher also uses assignments to know how far the students understand the materials (ET 1).

Concurrently, based on students' experience, they do assignments from the teacher and directly upload the results of their assignments to *Moodle* by taking pictures of their work or typing in the form of *Words* as stated as follow:

"My English teacher gives assignments after delivering the material or class discussion. I did the assignment in my workbook and then sent the picture of my work to Moodle." (ST 2)

Students also experienced being given an assignment before the lesson started and will be discussed together later during the class (ST 4). Usually, they do the assignment in the workbook (ST 3), take the picture of it (ST 1), and submit it on *Moodle* (ST 5). If they are asked to type in words, the document is sent directly to *Moodle* (ST 5).

It conforms with the UNESCO distant learning requirements; based on the interview results, online evaluations must continuously be upgraded to monitor learning activities in a statement made by UNESCO (2020). According to them, teachers should do formative evaluations regularly (daily or 2-3 times a week). Formative assessments have shown to be a valuable tool for tracking learning processes and keeping students updated on their progress, especially true for television or radio-based distance learning. For ensuring that all students can get the questions and provide feedback, formative assessment techniques and formats (e.g., SMS-based items and replies) must be adjusted. That assessment pattern has been made in hybrid English learning at SMKN 1 Ponorogo.

3.2. Challenges of the use of Moodle-based LMS for hybrid English Language Learning

Moodle as an LMS for online learning during hybrid learning during the pandemic encountered many advantages and disadvantages. Both students and English teachers face various challenges.

English Teachers

During the implementation of hybrid language learning using *Moodle-based LMS*, English teachers experienced challenges as follows:

Table 4 Challenges Found by the Teachers

English Teachers	Technical problem	Web error, and problems came from students such as students' low storage device and bad internet connection (the main).
	Operating Moodle-based LMS	Difficult to operate Moodle-based LMS properly for old generation teacher
	Creating interactive learning material	Creating interactive learning material on their own. Students' low storage devices force teachers to make simple interactive and interesting material.
	Assessment	Could not be used repeatedly. Teachers must prepare another platform for follow-up final exams .

The table above was the finding of challenges face by English teachers which interpreted and discussed as the following parts:

Technical Problems

The results of interviews with English teachers at SMKN 1 Ponorogo showed that often when learning was being carried out, there were times when technical problems occurred. Most of these technical problems came from students (ET 1), but there were also those from both because the web server likes sudden errors (ET 2). In addition, the internet connection was sometimes an obstacle, especially when the electricity was off; usually, the connection would also break. Those who use WiFi were also disturbed. An English teacher said,

"We always try to get online classes through Moodle to start and close on time, but sometimes, the web server goes down, so we both teachers and students cannot access Moodle. The problem again is when there is heavy rain, the signal for the internet must be difficult." (ET 2)

In line with this, Ferri, Grifoni, and Guzzo (2020) stated that insufficient bandwidth was a problem noted in all nations (although to varying degrees), resulting in delays or connection failures during courses and video conferences. In truth, a broadband connection is not available in every location. It means that in certain circumstances, a structural gap exists that creates a barrier to individuals connecting. This issue also exists in Estonia, where digital tools are used in daily learning, and e-learning days are included in the curriculum (Ferri et al., 2020).

Operating Moodle-based LMS

Changes in face-to-face learning in the classroom because of the pandemic that makes the learning system turn online to hybrid learning were challenging for teachers. Especially senior teachers to wrestle with the use of technology, such as material creation, material delivery, and discussion to assessment. One of three English teachers stated,

"I am an old generation teacher. It is difficult to operate this sudden technology. I cannot be as sophisticated as millennial teachers because I am not familiar with using LMS. Years before any need to teach using this LMS, I did manual teaching in front of the class during the pandemic, to be sure." (ET 2)

Nonetheless, some teachers find it simple to utilize *Moodle* because they have previously received training from school (ET 1). IT professionals were always available to assist teachers if they found any problems accessing *Moodle* (ET 3)

Research by Efriana (2021) reported the same findings; the ability to operate technology was also one of the obstacles found during online learning during the pandemic. She found not all teachers are not good enough at computers or gadgets to participate in online learning activities. According to specific research findings, some teachers can utilize computers, but their abilities to use them to help to teach are still restricted. Some of them are still having trouble connecting to the internet, utilizing various learning programs, and creating media/instructional videos. However, a few teachers who have grasped ICT as a whole have been able to generate engaging EFL materials (Efriana, 2021).

Creating Interactive learning Material

The lack of storage space that students complain about makes teachers have to rack their brains so that learning delivered online was exciting but still simple. Often, simple media make students less able to understand the material (ET 1). Another English teacher also stated that no matter how interesting the media provided online, will be less interesting than learning in class (ET 2). Putting additional resources for another platform such as video from YouTube or Google Drive helps students understand better the material from the book or resume from the teacher, yet it needs more quota for access. Some students worried about it (ET 3). Research by Lapada, Miguel, Robledo, and Alam (2020) also showed that it is essential for a teacher to create interactive and innovative materials limited by file size. Teachers must be more creative to make the material as concise as possible, but students can understand this material well.

Assessments

The results of the interview showed that testing students' abilities was a challenge for several reasons: a) the exam assessment feature in *Moodle-web LMS* could not be set and used repeatedly by students; instead, it was a one-time opportunity just for each student at a time (ET 2), b) not all students could attend the assessment at the same time, due to illness or other

reasons, so c) the teacher must create new questions using other media so that students so those who could not take the exam together can still participate (ET 3). Others believed that follow-up exams using another platform as final exams were complicated (ET 1).

Aligned with exams and score taking, UNESCO (2020) mentioned that the implementation of assessment is a must to determine how far students understand the material presented by the teacher. Regardless, a study by Swan (cited in Kearns, 2012) showed that discussion, papers, other written tasks, projects, quizzes and examinations, and group work were among the strategies assessed in 73 online courses. Hence, based on the interview results, the English teacher at SMKN 1 Ponorogo only had a problem when doing the final test in the form of multiple-choice in *Moodle*, which could only be done one time at a time. Teachers could optimize daily scores using quizzes, presentations or discussions to help students' final score if there were problems with the assessments grading on *Moodle*.

Eleventh Graders

During the implementation of hybrid language learning using *Moodle-based LMS*, the eleventh graders experienced challenges as follows:

Table 5 Challenges Found by Students

	Technical problem	<i>Moodle</i> web server error, limited devices storage, lack of internet connection and devices (laptop and printer).
	Online learning material	Online learning material was not exciting. It was boring because it was only a summary and was not interactive that involved hand-on activities together. Unattractive material made students' learning mood down.
Eleventh Graders	Distraction	Conditions of each different home create different disturbances. Some parents do not understand that their children need particular time for studying. Some of them are often asked to do something, such as earn money and do chores that interfere with learning time. Interference from younger family members. Some have to help their parents work, such as being a shopkeeper while studying online. Distraction from Social media and games.

The table above was the finding of challenges face by students which interpreted and discussed as the following parts:

Technical Problems

The eleventh graders' interview results showed three main challenges in technological tools they usually face in online learning using *Moodle*. First, *Moodle* web error or busy (ST 5). Due to the error, the web could not be accessed and only show blank pages (ET 1). Limited internal storage causes lag to open the web or the files on *Moodle* (ST 2). Students also experienced a lack of devices, such as laptop and printer (ST 3) and internet connection (ST 4). Those students who live in villages rely on *WiFi* which often goes wrong and have to buy additional quota for back up (ST 4). Students also experienced the storage devices to access the material easier. They have to pay more for printing the materials to help them study because paperless is difficult as stated by student follow:

"I cannot learn just by looking at the summary of the pdf file from the teacher. I need to take notes or print out the material. To print the materials, I need more money because I do not have a personal printer."
(ST 1)

Printed online material could be combined into a coursebook. It could be crossed out with additional notes to make students easier to learn (ST 2).

From their statements, it can be concluded that problems such as the *Moodle-web LMS* web error to an inaccessible white screen can hinder teaching and learning activities. As research conducted by Reimers, Schleicher, Saavedra, and Tuominen (2020) found something similar, *Moodle-web LMS* is often inaccessible for several reasons, such as an error from the start or too many students accessing it simultaneously so that it becomes an error. Furthermore, Octaberlina and Muslimin's (2020) findings also showed that students often face a lack of internet connection. They also find that students often lack storage to access material from the teacher, which impacts the learning and learning process (Octaberlina & Muslimin, 2020). Moreover, Efriana (2021) found severe more problems. Some students reside in places where there is no access to the internet. They are unable to get class materials and homework assignments from teachers over the internet network.

Online Learning Material

Interview results indicated that the media displayed by the teacher in the online class during hybrid learning was not exciting and boring because it was only a summary (ST 2), and was not interactive that involved hand-on activities together (ST 1). Unattractive material makes students' learning mood down so that their interest in learning is low, as stated by one of the following students:

"My enthusiasm for learning is poor since the teacher's materials are uninteresting. I'm also bored with reading from the coursebook." (ST 3)

For these reasons, students find it challenging to understand the content of the material provided by the teacher. They often complain and need help from others.

"During the pandemic and studying from home, I did not understand much material because I had to study on my own. I sometimes do not know where to start to study, so I am just doing my homework." (ST 5)

In line with this result, Yuzulia (2021) also found that students said that some teachers just gave tasks without explaining. They had to understand the materials in various areas, such as English, which needed more teacher explanation.

According to Purwanto (2010), learning outcomes could be a students' behavior resulting from learning. His study proved that students who mastered a variety of resources utilized in the teaching and learning process had changed their behavior. This behavior includes the mood in learning (Fitriani, Hidayatulloh, & Agra, 2018). The interview results also showed that students feel bored and have low enthusiasm for learning since the materials are uninteresting. Moreover, this behavior affects the level of students' understanding. It found that online learning is complex for individuals because the material provided is limited, so it is difficult to understand the material with a slightly higher level of understanding, such as Grammar.

The following are the eleventh graders' statements:

"My learning type is visual. I cannot learn just by reading at home. Online learning makes me dizzy because I only read limited material without being able to see it directly." (ST 1)

"My English learning ability is low; I find it difficult to understand English material at home. I need a teacher who meets me face to face to help me study." (ST 3)

"I find learning Grammar independently at home very difficult. I need more and future discussion." (ST 4)

From those interviews could be concluded that students are more eager to learn and understand if there are face-to-face discussions in class. Dios and Charlo (2021) proposed a comparative study that showed face-to-face classes have more straightforward explanations since more didactic resources are used and more engagement. They are more dynamic, which increases motivation. Following interview results, students' opinion is that face-to-face learning can help them better understand the material.

Distractions

When studying at home, interview results showed that the conditions of each different home create different disturbances. When studying at home, those who can study in quiet conditions will be disturbed by crowded conditions. Some parents do not understand that their children need particular time for studying. Some of them are often asked to do something, such as chores that interfere with learning time (ST 2).

The research findings mentioned above were also found by Rasmitadila et al. (2020), which stated that one factor is a less suitable home learning environment. Families' activities induce distractions, decreasing the concentration required to comprehend the teaching material. The role of parents is needed to create a good learning environment at home. Furthermore, there is also interference from younger family members, such as younger siblings (ST 3) or nephews (ST 4), who ask to play or ask to teach to do their assignments. Some have to help their parents work, such as being a shopkeeper while studying online (ST 5). For example, the following students have to look after the shop while doing schoolwork.

A study by Rasmitadila et al. (2020) showed that the support of parents is essential. Online learning, according to parents, has improved the quality of their children's education. When online learning was first popular, they found that parents were pleased that their children's school was using it. Nevertheless, parental support began to crumble after a month. Loss of income has reduced expenses, including Internet access for families whose parents have lost their jobs. In this case, the interview results showed that parents finally ask their children to help with work or earn money under the pretext that their online school activities run smoothly (Rasmitadila et al., 2020).

Moreover, social media is considered something with both good and bad impacts, depending on how to respond. Based on the interview, social media (ST 1) and games' (ST 2) interference as entertainment makes students feel lazy to study. Anderson et al. (2013) found that social media is frequently viewed as a distraction. A platform with that kind of content linked to so many different connections that it quickly diverts users' attention away from their initial purpose of visiting or leads them down several unproductive routes (Anderson et al.,

2013; Knowles & Dixon, 2016). Interview results from this study also show that students often get distracted from social media. Moreover, teachers are concerned that if students are urged to open these online services, they may become addicted to following the current "hot" issue and diverge from their studies. Keeping pupils 'on target' when they are online is considered considerably more complex, and without thought and planning, it can be disastrous. (Knowles & Dixon, 2016)

3.3. Steps to Overcome the Challenge of the use of Moodle-based LMS for hybrid English Language Learning

English Teachers

Based on the interview results, several steps were taken to deal with English teachers' and eleventh graders' challenges during hybrid learning. Some of the things below were done to prevent these challenges. The teacher suggests as follows:

Table 6. Steps to overcome the Challenges Found by Teachers

English Teachers	Technical problem	Change the hours on the same day but at different times while ensuring that the website can be reassessed, or change the hours on another day according to a mutual agreement. Send the materials and assignments through <i>WhatsApp</i> group, then discuss them together in the group chat.
	Operating Moodle-based LMS	Internal training, evaluations, parents participation.
	Creating interactive learning material	Creating summary on PDF and putting additional materials from <i>YouTube</i> .
	Assessment	Dividing assignments with other teachers (fellow English teachers) to make several types of questions as backup questions and organize questions on quizzes or Google Forms.

The table above was the finding of steps to overcome problems face by teachers which interpreted and discussed as the following parts:

Technical Problems

Technical problems, in this case, were more directed to things that burden students on the teacher's view during learning through *Moodle*. One of these problems is the webserver from *Moodle*, which sometimes goes down. These problems can interfere with learning and teaching activities. As the interview result showed that the web server that caused the error was down, to counter this, the teacher acts directly to make sure the class keeps going. Two things can be done; the first is to change the hours on the same day but at different times while ensuring that the website can be reassessed, or change the hours on another day according to a mutual agreement (ET 2). The second alternative, the teacher sends materials and assignments through the *WhatsApp* group, then discusses them together in the chat group (ET 3).

Research by Ghounane (2020) showed that teachers need to integrate more than one platform online to support online learning since every platform has its deficiency and

advantage. For instance, if only the teacher relies on one platform, for example, *Moodle*, and suddenly something unexpected happens, such as a web server error, the teacher must have a backup platform to ensure that learning does not stop.

Interview results showed that the school has distributed a free card and an internet package for one month regarding the internet connection. It could help ease the student's burden on needing more data quota and a backup for *WiFi* users (ET 3). Kemendikbud (2021) stated that students, teachers, higher students, and lecturers must receive quota assistance from the Ministry of Culture and the Education Office. Nevertheless, the school can also provide additional quota assistance, such as credit, new starter packs, or credit vouchers. However, the implementation of hybrid learning that combines face-to-face school attendance with online learning from home makes it easier for students to use their internet quota.

Learning on How to Operate Moodle-based LMS

One of the efforts made by the teacher to overcome the first problem was providing the tools and learning materials creatively. Learning to use technology actively was indeed a challenge, but in this way, teachers could explore more to find out the type of student learning and what students like or dislike during their learning both in face-to-face class and online. To understand more about *Moodle-based LMS*, SMK N 1 Ponorogo provided internal training for teachers and students to operate *Moodle* effectively and efficiently, as stated by the following English teacher:

"The IT and development team from the school conducts periodic training, especially the teachers on the Moodle LMS application, such as how to install, operate its features, and how the material is delivered via Moodle. They also provide an opportunity for teachers to express opinions if the layout design from Moodle is confusing so that it is made easier as needed."
(ET 1)

In line with these findings, Efriana (2021) stated that teachers can choose platforms that are easier to use, such as the *WhatsApp* application, an addition even though they have been using *Moodle*. Teachers must, however, gradually increase their IT skills, for example, by attending related workshops and learning from other teachers with more significant IT expertise. Following a YouTube video lesson that covers a variety of learning application purposes, how to utilize them, and how to create instructional films may also help them develop IT skills.

The school also facilitates joint evaluations to solve problems found during online learning. Therefore, teaching and learning activities in the future can be more manageable. An English teacher stated,

"Almost every teacher and student encounter problems while learning and teaching from home, but the school facilitates us to stay open and conduct regular evaluations to improve learning and make it easier for both students and teachers." (ET 3)

In addition to the teachers participating in training and evaluation, parents' participation was essential. Especially considering that now hybrid learning has been implemented, where students must also study regularly, approaching parents is significant. As stated by an English teacher follows:

“Not only can teachers who can only supervise students studying at home, but parents must also take part and play a role. We teachers, assisted by the homeroom teacher, always approach students' parents so that they are willing to help succeed in this online teaching and learning activity.” (ET 3)

Furthermore, the teacher, assisted by the homeroom teacher, approached the parents. According to Ho (cited in Đurišić & Bunijevac, 2017), today's parents are often concerned with the diversions and responsibilities of daily life. Some parents cannot attend school activities or regularly participate in their children due to limited income, restrictive work hours, and language challenges (Apriyanti, 2020). That is why teachers must always approach parents to understand how vital their role is during learning from home and hybrid learning. The English teacher can also reach out to students by directly contacting their parents. If the circumstances permit, the teacher can make a home visit to help with the homeroom teacher (Efriana, 2021).

Learning Media and Materials

The interview showed that teachers usually make resumes as short as possible in *pdf* form for less attractive media issues to break down the storage that students must use and include a more detailed explanation of the material on Google Drive or YouTube (ET 2). This study found that making the material as concise as possible was due to students who complained that they did not have sufficient storage space for files. Using other media such as *YouTube* or saving explanatory video files in online storage applications like *Google Drive* was expected to help. Ardinengtyas and Himawan (2021) proved that *Moodle*, according to students, promotes flexible learning and efficient learning. Students can use the internet to find any learning material they need. They have many opportunities to study and can use the optimal learning technique. The discussion feature also displays attachments that are directly linked to other sources or websites to be more concise and efficient (Singh, 2010).

Other researchers, such as Rahayuningsih (2016), found making media suitable for students and making sure they do not get bored difficult. She added that the materials are designed as PDFs, student worksheets, videos, and PowerPoint presentations. The materials were developed in order to be an excellent material that the student could understand. In terms of the participant, good teaching material is aligned with the learning purpose, clear, and easy to comprehend. In line with Rahayuningsih (2016), teachers need to communicate with other teachers or students and find the best media for attractive, engaging, and readily understanding. If still want to make the media as concise as possible not to burden students, it is expected to make an exciting and communicative assessment that directly provides feedback (UNESCO, 2020). Fitriani et al. (2018) added that visual images could assist teachers in providing difficult-to-accept learning materials to students, offering information and communication technology learning media to improve motivation and learning results.

Assessing Students

To overcome the problem of not using the assessment feature repeatedly at different times, teachers at SMKN 1 Ponorogo did several things. First is dividing assignments with other teachers (fellow English teachers) to make several types of questions as backup questions (ET 1).

Secondly, teachers must organize questions on platforms other than *Moodle*, such as quizzes or Google Forms, as stated by an English teacher follows:

"For the follow-up test, the other teachers and I use Google Form; besides being easier, the size is also capable so that it does not burden students. If you want a small test, you can use quizzes." (ET 2)

Moreover, the teacher also could strategies like peer feedback activities (Mostert & Snowball, 2013), discussion boards (Champion & Gunnlaugson, 2017; Skinner, 2007), and incorporating the study or working groups community of practice framework into discussions or assignments. There are opportunities to increase communication and connectedness between students in online courses (Wang, 2010; Ghounane, 2020). As a result, in order to alleviate this issue, linking students should be a deliberate aspect of evaluation and course design (Weleschuk, Dyjur, & Kelly, 2019).

Eleventh Graders

The following are the ways that students do to overcome the challenges they face during hybrid learning using *Moodle-based LMS*:

Table 7. Steps to overcome the Challenges Found by Students

Eleventh Graders	Technical problems' solutions	<i>Moodle</i> web server error = Tell others and the teachers immediately. Limited devices storage = print out the online material and make your own notes. Lack of internet connection = prepares own data internet, get free internet package quotas from schools and the Ministry of Education and Culture and move to a better connection area.
	Online learning material – ask for help	Need help from teachers, other people, parents, siblings, friends, and even private tutors.
	Avoid distraction	Request a particular time, request a particular room, use assistance apps <i>Forest: Stay Focused</i> and turn smartphones' notification off.

The table above was the finding of steps to overcome problems face by students which interpreted and discussed as the following parts:

Technical problems' solutions

First challenge students found were *the Moodle-based LMS* error web server. To overcome the problem, tell the others on *WhatsApp* group chat immediately and wait for the teacher to respond how the class will be going (ST 1).

The second challenge was the lack of technological tools. The problem with the tools used is not supportive enough to become serious if there is no prevention. Some students said that they do not have laptops and study only using smartphones (ST 3). Based on the interview, learning to use a smartphone is considered less satisfying in layout than a PC or laptop, but it was adequate and efficient because they can learn anywhere and anytime (ST 3). Hence, they still prefer to learn to use a smartphone (ST 4). Learning using smartphones is also easier to operate and they can directly chat with friends through *WhatsApp* if they want more discussions (ST 2).

Reimers et al. (2020) stated that *Moodle* is mobile-friendly and allows teachers to add plugins. One of the advantages of a mobile-friendly website is that the participant's smartphone

does not require any extra software (Shevchenko, Kuhlmann, & Reips, 2021). That is why using *Moodle* is better on a smartphone than on other devices. Gamage and Perera (2021) found that smartphones were the most portable of the gadgets available because of their small size, lightweight, relatively long battery life, and quick internet connection with built-in 4G and WiFi technology. As a result, during the lockdown, when there was a lack of preparation, mobile phones may have proven to be the most versatile instruments for accessing online lectures and staying current with learning. The findings of their study might be applied to higher education institutions in other developing nations where limited network coverage and a lack of computer equipment have resulted in a "digital gap" among students. Students can use their mobile phones to access class materials, learn management systems to access information online to fulfill their information demands rapidly, and access academic databases and a website, to name a few (Darko-Adjei, 2019).

Relating to lack of internet connection, students often experienced losing *WiFi* connection when rain comes or the electricity goes out. Therefore, they always have internet packages available for such emergency needs (ST 1). In addition to buying packages with their own money, students also get free internet package quotas from schools and the Ministry of Education and Culture. Some also try to reach a better internet connection. It might be on the other area of the house, like on the second floor (ST 5) or going to the neighboring houses (ST 3). In addition to providing emergency internet packages, students need have a list of known people who can provide *WiFi* assistance, such as relatives or friends, as stated by students follow:

"Before class starts, I make sure that the internet connection at my house can be used optimally. When there are signs of an error, I immediately go to my uncle's place, about 2 KM from my house, which has a good WIFI connection."(ST 4)

"My house does not have WIFI, so if the connection from my packet internet network has problems, I go to a friend's house, or go to a relative's place that has WIFI." (ST 2)

Efriana (2021) stated that students should continue to do the assignments manually to overcome the lack of internet connection. The most important thing is to continue studying and remain at home. Students who are having trouble connecting to the internet can connect with other family members or save bandwidth by connecting only when necessary.

The next challenge was device storage. The storage problem becomes a dangerous obstacle if it is not fixed while the online class is still in progress. Research showed that students print out independently to study simultaneously to be crossed out (ST 2) and make summaries in notebooks and workbooks (ST 1). For students, print offers various advantages. It is lightweight, inexpensive, readily available, and convenient to use. Students do not need special equipment to utilize it, and print materials may be used anywhere with proper lighting. The contents can be reviewed at the students' leisure. Mizrachi (2014) found that students prefer reading their course materials in print to reading them electronically, in line with the interview results. However, the more significant expense of print material and the convenience of internet access typically influence their actual behaviors. He also stated that despite technological advancements and more electronic possibilities, students still choose print for deep learning—the tangible aspects of holding, flipping, and thumbing through a printed work. Also, linear progression as opposed to vertical scrolling, better memory cues on printed pages;

greater inclination to highlight and annotate their printed readings; and less eye strain and fatigue are just a few of the reasons why students prefer print.

In contrast, Craven (2017) briefly explains the advantages of paperless for students: saving money, saving time, streamlining learning, making more resources available, better material and assignment organization, no more lost paper, and improving teacher-parent communication, more accessible data, and more engaged learners. However, the interview resulted in not all students being able to learn paperlessly. They need to make notes to the book or materials. They need time to get used to learning to use paperless.

Ask for Help

Students found it difficult to understand the material because they had to learn on their own without a real tutor, like in a face-to-face class. The interview results showed that they need help from teachers (ST 1), other people, parents, siblings (ST 2), friends (ST 3), and even private tutors (ST 4). However, there are students that feel ashamed to ask teachers or friends directly and depend more on the internet for self language learning (ST 5). Yuzulia (2021) stated that many students found solutions to their problems by asking their friends, participating in private courses, or contacting the teacher directly. Her finding showed the same as the interview results. Moreover, besides asking their teacher or parents or even friends directly, students usually go to *YouTube* to find more explanations about the material discussed (ST 1).

Avoid Distractions

Disturbances in learning could come from anywhere. Environmental conditions, parents, siblings, parents' part-time jobs, sometimes even from the environment around the house, were in the form of noise from neighbors. In addition, interference from social media was experienced by almost all students based on the interview results.

One of the efforts to prevent interference from parents or families who like to order this while students' study is to request a particular time to study from 07-12 noon, and in the evening from 7-10 pm (ST 1). In addition, some choose to stay in a particular room, for instance, a locked room, for a period to focus on studying (ST 2).

Churiyah et al. (2020) found that parents as monitoring individuals should all have a thorough understanding of the concept of distance learning. Parents must understand and place themselves that children study at home because of the pandemic conditions. They study at home, not for vacation, so parents must understand the situation and conditions. With the help of the homeroom teacher, the teacher has to approach students' parents to understand (Rasmitadila et al., 2020). The interview results show that some students still have to help with homework when they should study online. It can be concluded that the approach taken by teachers to parents is less successful. Parents must also be firm with other family members. For example, ask minor children not to disturb those studying or taking online classes. Parents must set boundaries so that children also understand.

In addition, if there is a particular room that is quiet or the door can be locked, it can be used for a particular study room. It could be a bedroom or another more closed room to minimize disturbances from inside the house or from the outside environment. Research from Rahiem (2020) showed that a quiet and closed room could make students study comfortably.

There are several things that these students do to overcome distractions from social media, which are the toughest distractions because they learn from smartphones. It is easy to get distracted from the excitement of surfing on social media. This study found that students do the 60-minute study method, one-minute open social media to not get bored and keep their minds fresh (ST 1). Some students use assistance apps like *Forest: Stay Focused*. This application helps students to stay focused on learning without being distracted by the fun of social media (ST 5). Students also turn off the notification feature for all other applications while studying to keep their attention focused on studying (ST 4). In addition, once again, the role of parents is needed to supervise and help students study at home constantly. Make sure that students do not play smartphones to surf on social media only (ST 5). They have to study first, and then when they are tired, they can use social media.

Nevertheless, a study by Uğur and Turan (2019) found that many students were unsure whether social media were seen to be a distraction from learning. They had to keep in mind that social media is a medium for refreshing, it does not distract their learning focus, yet the research shows that students stop learning when they are busy scrolling social media.

In line with Uğur and Turan (2019), Mohmmmed, Khidhir, Nazeer, and Vijayan (2020) found that social media platforms like YouTube and MS Kaizala enable teachers and students to communicate quickly and easily. It might also be used to give tips or brief remarks. Furthermore, it is the simplest way to connect with students because it uses less Internet data. Furthermore, the majority of this software is already installed on the phones of the students. Churiyah et al. (2020) mentioned that parents have to consistently monitor students at home and understand the role of digital devices in supporting their learning.

4. Conclusion

The implementation of hybrid language learning during COVID-19 pandemic, teachers and students have different experiences. In terms of the preparation needs, the teacher refers more to the preparation of materials and assessments, while the students are more directed to the preparation of independent learning from home and doing assignments. The layout design and features provided by *Moodle* can be adapted to the needs of students and teachers. Problems encountered by teachers are mostly caused by students, such as inadequate student internet and a lack of phone space on students' smartphones and force teachers to make the material as concise as possible, and add additional material from other sources. Studying independently by using summary is difficult for students. They need help from others to explain the material. Teachers should anticipate and be aware of the problems faced by students and make sure that students can follow the lessons and do the assignments correctly. Coordination with students' parents when they are studying at home is particularly crucial for monitoring. It is important for both teachers and students to always be aware of the challenges and to anticipate them. In the future, this research is expected to be a reference for schools that want to use *Moodle-based LMS* in the implementation of hybrid learning, especially in language learning, or it could be for other subjects. This research can also be used as a scientific and theoretical school evaluation material that can be an approach if conditions like this occur in the future. However, this research covers only English teachers and eleventh graders' side of the use of *Moodle* for hybrid language learning. It is highly recommended to further researchers to develop the teachers and students' sight with different levels of education on seeing the experience and perception of the use of *Moodle* or can be another LMS platform, such as *Google Classroom* or *Edmodo* for language learning.

References

- Abuhammad, S. (2020). Barriers to distance learning during the COVID-19 outbreak: A qualitative review from parents' perspective. *Heliyon*, 6(11), 1–5. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2020.e05482>
- Alhothli, N. I. (2015). *Investigating the impact of using Moodle as an e-learning tool for students in an English language institute* (Master's thesis, University of Montana, United States). Retrieved from <https://scholarworks.umt.edu/etd/4524>
- Apriyanti, C. (2020). Distance learning and obstacles during Covid-19 outbreak. *Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Dasar*, 7(2), 68–83. doi: <https://doi.org/10.30659/pendas.7.2.68-83>
- Ardinengtyas, A., & Himawan, A. N. (2021). Enhancing ELT classroom using Moodle e-learning during the pandemic: Students' and teachers' voices. *IJEE (Indonesian Journal of English Education)*, 1(1), 24–39. doi: <https://doi.org/10.15408/ijee.v1i1.20220>
- Baxter, P., & Jack, S. (2008). Qualitative case study methodology: Study design and implementation for novice researchers. *The Qualitative Report*, 13(4), 544–559. doi: <https://doi.org/10.46743/2160-3715/2008.1573>
- Bhalalusesa, R., Lukwaro, E. E. A., & Clemence, M. (2013). Challenges of using e-learning management systems faced by the academic staff in distance-based institutions from developing countries: A case study of the Open University of Tanzania. *Huria: Journal of the Open University of Tanzania*, 14(1), 89–110. Retrieved from <https://www.ajol.info/index.php/huria/article/view/110783>
- Champion, K., & Gunnlaugson, O. (2017). Fostering generative conversation in higher education course discussion boards. *Innovations in Education and Teaching International*, 55(6), 704–712. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1080/14703297.2017.1279069>
- Churiyah, M., Sholikhah, Filanti, & Sakdiyyah, D. A. (2020). Indonesia education readiness conducting distance learning in Covid-19 pandemic situation. *IJMMU: International Journal of Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding*, 7(6), 491–507. doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.18415/ijmmu.v7i6.1833>
- College of DuPage. (2015). *An introduction to hybrid teaching: Learning technologies*. Retrieved from <https://www.codlearningtech.org/PDF/hybridteachingworkbook.pdf>
- Craven, L. (2017, August 7). A paperless classroom: Benefits and challenges. *IAFOR*. Retrieved from <https://think.iafor.org/a-paperless-classroom-benefits-and-challenges/>
- Creswell, J. W., Hanson, W. E., Plano, V. L., & Morales, A. (2007). Qualitative research designs: Selection and implementation. *The Counseling Psychologist*, 35(2), 236–264. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1177/0011000006287390>
- Darko-Adjei, N. (2019). The use and effect of smartphones in students' learning activities: Evidence from the University of Ghana, Legon. *Library Philosophy and Practice 2019*. Retrieved from <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/2851/>
- Dios, M. T. C., & Charlo, J. C. P. (2021). Face-to-face vs. E-learning models in the Covid-19 era: Survey research in a Spanish university. *Education Sciences*, 11(6), 293. doi: <https://doi.org/10.3390/educsci11060293>
- Đurišić, M., & Bunijevac, M. (2017). Parental involvement as an important factor for successful education. *CEPS Journal*, 7(3), 137–153. Retrieved from <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1156936>
- Efriana, L. (2021). Problems of online learning during Covid-19 pandemic in the EFL classroom and the solution. *JELITA: Journal of English Language Teaching and Literature*, 2(1), 38–47. Retrieved from <https://jurnal.stkipmb.ac.id/index.php/jelita/article/view/74>
- Ferri, F., Grifoni, P., & Guzzo, T. (2020). Online learning and emergency remote teaching: Opportunities and challenges in emergency situations. *Societies*, 10(4), 86. doi: <https://doi.org/10.3390/soc10040086>
- Fitriani, Hidayatulloh, R. M. F., & Agra, H. S. P. (2018). Use of learning media ICT-based to improve motivation and the result of learning science in solar system materials. *Collase*, 1(6), 382–391. Retrieved from <https://journal.ikipsiliwangi.ac.id/index.php/collase/article/view/2300>

- Gamage, K. A. A., & Perera, E. (2021). Undergraduate students' device preferences in the transition to online learning. *Social Sciences*, 10(8), 288. doi: <https://doi.org/10.3390/socsci10080288>
- Ghounane, N. (2020). Moodle or social networks: What alternative refuge is appropriate to Algerian EFL students to learn during Covid-19 pandemic. *Arab World English Journal*, 11(3), 21–41. doi: <https://doi.org/10.24093/awej/vol11no3.2>
- Gill, P., Stewart, K., Treasure, E., & Chadwick, B. (2008). Methods of data collection in qualitative research: Interviews and focus groups. *British Dental Journal*, 204(6), 291–295. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1038/bdj.2008.192>
- Gillis, A., & Krull, L. M. (2020). COVID-19 remote learning transition in spring 2020: Class structures, student perceptions, and inequality in college courses. *Teaching Sociology*, 48(4), 283–299. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1177/0092055X20954263>
- Hodges, C., Moore, S., Locke, B., Trust, T., & Bond, A. (2020). Emergency remote teaching and online learning. *Educase Review*. Retrieved from <https://er.educause.edu/articles/2020/3/the-difference-between-emergency-remote-teaching-and-online-learning>
- Holiver, N., Kurbatova, T., & Bondar, I. (2020). Blended learning for sustainable education: Moodle-based English for specific purposes teaching at Kryvyi Rih National University. *Proceedings of E3S Web of Conferences*, 166. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1051/e3sconf/202016610006>
- Ivanović, M., Putnik, Z., Komlenov, Ž., Welzer, T., Hölbl, M., & Schweighofer, T. (2013). Usability and privacy aspects of moodle: Students' and teachers' perspective. *Informatica*, 37(3), 221–230. doi: <https://doi.org/10.31449/inf.v37i3.451>
- Kearns, L. R. (2012). Student assessment in online learning: Challenges and effective practices. *MERLOT*, 8(3), 198–208. Retrieved from http://jolt.merlot.org/vol8no3/kearns_0912.htm
- Kemdikbud. (2020). Panduan pembelajaran jarak jauh. *Kementrian, Kebudayaan, Riset, dan Teknologi*. Retrieved from <https://bersamahadapikorona.kemdikbud.go.id/panduan-pembelajaran-jarak-jauh/>
- Klimova, B. F., & Kacetl, J. (2015). Hybrid learning and its current role in the teaching of foreign languages. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 182, 477–481. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.04.830>
- Knowles, M., & Dixon, D. (2016). Guidance techniques to improve student engagement in critical reflection regarding the preparation of technical reports. *Student Engagement and Experience Journal*, 5(1). Retrieved from <http://sure.sunderland.ac.uk/id/eprint/6352>
- Lapada, A. A., Miguel, F. F., Robledo, D. A. R., & Alam, Z. F. (2020). Teachers' Covid-19 awareness, distance learning education experiences and perceptions towards institutional readiness and challenges. *International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research*, 19(6), 127–144. doi: <https://doi.org/10.26803/ijlter.19.6.8>
- Latham, B. (2007). *Sampling: What is it?* Retrieved from <https://docplayer.net/20989579-Sampling-what-is-it-quantitative-research-methods-engl-5377-spring-2007.html>
- Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *An expanded sourcebook: Qualitative data analysis*. London: Sage Publications.
- Mizrachi, D. (2014). Online or print: Which do students prefer? *Communications in Computer and Information Science*, 492(May), 733–742. doi: https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-14136-7_76
- Mohammed, A. O., Khidhir, B. A., Nazeer, A., & Vijayan, V. J. (2020). Emergency remote teaching during Coronavirus pandemic: the current trend and future directive at Middle East College Oman. *Innovative Infrastructure Solutions*, 5(3), 1–11. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s41062-020-00326-7>
- Moradi, K., Abdi, A., Valiee, S., & Rezaei, S. A. (2020). Nurses' experience of providing ethical care following an earthquake: A phenomenological study. *Nursing ethics*, 27(4), 911–923. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1177/0969733020907952>

- Mostert, M., & Snowball, J. D. (2013). Where angels fear to tread: Online peer-assessment in a large first-year class. *Assessment & Evaluation in Higher Education*, 38(6), 674–686. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1080/02602938.2012.683770>
- Octoberlina, L. R., & Muslimin, A. I. (2020). EFL students perspective towards online learning barriers and alternatives using Moodle/Google classroom during Covid-19 pandemic. *International Journal of Higher Education*, 9(6), 1–9. doi: <https://doi.org/10.5430/ijhe.v9n6p1>
- Purwanto. (2010). *Evaluation of learning outcomes*. Yogyakarta: Student Library.
- Prasetya, R. E. (2021). *Effectiveness of teaching English for Specific Purposes in LMS Moodle: Lecturers' Perspective*. JELTL, 6(1), 93–109. Retrieved from <https://jeltl.org/index.php/jeltl/article/view/498>
- Prasetyaningtyas, S. (2021). Pelaksanaan Belajar dari Rumah (BDR) secara online selama darurat Covid-19 di SMPN 1 Semin. *Jurnal Karya Ilmiah Guru*, 5(1), 86–94. Retrieved from <https://jurnal-dikpora.jogjaprovo.go.id/index.php/jurnalideguru/article/download/139/165/>
- Rahayuningsih, D. (2016). Student teachers' challenges in developing teaching materials during teaching practicum in vocational. *Journal of English and Education*, 4(2), 24–34. Retrieved from <https://ejournal.upi.edu/index.php/L-E/article/view/4629>
- Rahiem, M. D. H. (2020). The emergency remote learning experience of university students in Indonesia amidst the COVID-19 crisis. *International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research*, 19(6), 1–26. doi: <https://doi.org/10.26803/ijlter.19.6.1>
- Rasmitadila, Aliyyah, R. R., Rachmadtullah, R., Samsudin, A., Syaodih, E., Nurtanto, M., & Tambunan, A. R. S. (2020). The perceptions of primary school teachers of online learning during the Covid-19 pandemic period: A case study in Indonesia. *Journal of Ethnic and Cultural Studies*, 7(2), 90–109. doi: <https://doi.org/10.29333/ejecs/388>
- Reimers, F., Schleicher, A., Saavedra, J., & Tuominen, S. (2020). Supporting the continuation of teaching and learning during the COVID-19 pandemic - Annotated resources for online learning. *OECD*. Retrieved from <https://www.oecd.org/education/Supporting-the-continuation-of-teaching-and-learning-during-the-COVID-19-pandemic.pdf>
- Shevchenko, Y., Kuhlmann, T., & Reips, U. D. (2021). Samply: A user-friendly smartphone app and web-based means of scheduling and sending mobile notifications for experience-sampling research. *Behavior Research Methods*, 53(4), 1710–1730. doi: <https://doi.org/10.3758/s13428-020-01527-9>
- Singh, N. M. (2010). *Moodle and its features* (Undergraduate thesis, National Institute of Technology, Rourkella, India). Retrieved from <http://ethesis.nitrkl.ac.in/1751/>
- Skinner, E. (2007). Building knowledge and community through online discussion. *Journal of Geography in Higher Education*, 31(3), 381–391. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1080/03098260601065151>
- Smith, C. J., Kramer, R. J., Myhre, G., Alterskjær, K., Collins, W., Sima, A., . . . Forster, P. M. (2020). Effective radiative forcing and adjustments in CMIP6 models. *Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics*, 20(16), 9591–9618. doi:10.5194/acp-20-9591-2020
- Suppatsereee, S., & Dennis, N. (2010). The use of Moodle for teaching and learning English at tertiary level in Thailand. *International Journal of the Humanities*, 8(6), 29–46. doi: <https://doi.org/10.18848/1447-9508/CGP/v08i06/42964>
- Uğur, N. G., & Turan, A. H. (2019). Social media in education: A distraction or motivation? *The Online Journal of Quality in Higher Education*, 6(1), 21–31. Retrieved from <http://www.tojih.net/journals/tojih/articles/v06i01/v06i01-03.pdf>
- UNESCO. (2020). UNESCO COVID-19 education response education sector issue notes distance learning strategies in response to COVID-19 school closures (Issue Note No 2.1 - April 2020). *United Nation Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization*. Retrieved from <https://en.unesco.org/covid19/educationresponse/issuenotes>

- Vyas, D., & Veer, G. C. V. D. (2006). Experience as meaning: Some underlying concepts and implications for design. *Proceedings of the 13th European conference on Cognitive ergonomics: Trust and control in complex socio-technical systems* (pp. 81–91). doi: <https://doi.org/10.1145/1274892.1274906>
- Wang, J-M. (2010). Online collaboration and offline interaction between students using asynchronous tools in blended learning. *AJET: Australasian Journal of Educational Technology*, 26(6), 830–846. doi: <https://doi.org/10.14742/ajet.1045>
- Weleschuk, A., Dyjur, P., & Kelly, P. (2019). Online assessment in higher education. *Taylor Institute for Teaching and Learning Guide Series*. Retrieved from <https://taylorinstitute.ucalgary.ca/sites/default/files/TI%20Guides/Online%20Assessment%20Guide-2019-10-24.pdf>
- Yin, R. K. (2003). *Case study research: Design and methods* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Yuzulia, I. (2021). The challenges of online learning during pandemic: Students' voice. *Wanastra: Jurnal Bahasa dan Sastra*, 13(1), 8–12.